# IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE MIDDLE DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA

. . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . .

BARBARA E. VARNER,

Plaintiff, . CIVIL ACTION

NO. 1:CV 01-0725

VS.

COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA, . (JUDGE YVETTE KANE)

NINTH JUDICIAL DISTRICT,

CUMBERLAND COUNTY; CUMBERLAND
COUNTY; S. GARETH GRAHAM,
Individually, and JOSEPH
OSENKARSKI, individually,

Defendants.

Deposition of: HON. GEORGE E. HOFFER

Taken by : Defendant Cumberland County Court

Date : April 4, 2003, 1:46 p.m.

Before : Emily Clark, RMR, Reporter-Notary

Place : Cumberland County Courthouse

One Courthouse Square Carlisle, Pennsylvania

# APPEARANCES:

DEBRA K. WALLET, ESQUIRE For - Plaintiff

ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICE OF PENNSYLVANIA COURTS

BY: A. TAYLOR WILLIAMS, ESQUIRE

For - Defendant Commonwealth of Pennsylvania Ninth Judicial District, Cumberland County

THOMAS, THOMAS & HAFER

BY: JAMES K. THOMAS, II, ESQUIRE PAUL J. DELLASEGA, ESQUIRE

For - Defendant Cumberland County

APPEARANCES (continued): MONTGOMERY, McCRACKEN, WALKER & RHOADS, LLP BY: L. KRISTEN BLANCHARD, ESQUIRE For - Defendant S. Gareth Graham SWEENEY & SHEEHAN, P.C. BY: PAUL LANCASTER ADAMS, ESQUIRE For - Defendant Joseph L. Osenkarski ALSO PRESENT: MS. BARBARA E. VARNER MR. S. GARETH GRAHAM MR. JOSEPH L. OSENKARSKI 

1 INDEX 2 WITNESS 3 Hon. George E. Hoffer Examination 4 By Ms. Wallet 4, 78 5 By Mr. Dellasega 66 6 By Ms. Blanchard 77 7 EXHIBITS 8 No. Description Identified 9 9 5 pages, handwritten notes 10 2 2-page memo, 3/31/98, to Osenkarski 31 from Varner 11 1-page "Personnel Action Form" 12 33 13 1-page handwritten letter, 6/1/98, to 41 Osenkarski from Varner 14 5 3 pages, handwritten notes 42 15 2 pages: 1-page memo, 2/11/98, to Hoffer 49 from Hartnett; 1-page memo, 2/4/98, to 16 Hartnett from Varner 17 2-page letter, 3/3/98, to Hartnett from 50 18 Varner 1 page, handwritten notes, 3/4/98 51 19 20 1-page letter, 2/16/99, to Varner 54 from Hoffer 21 10 1 page, handwritten notes 55 22 11 1-page memo, 3/27/92, to Hoffer 57 23 from Varner 12 1-page memo, 4/5/02, to Varner from 59 24 Miller \* \* \* \* \* 25

1 STIPULATION 2 It is hereby stipulated by and between the 3 respective parties that sealing, certification and 4 filing are waived; and that all objections except as to 5 the form of the question are reserved until the time of 6 trial. 7 HON. GEORGE E. HOFFER, called as a witness, 8 being duly sworn, and testified as follows: 9 BY MS. WALLET: 10 Judge Hoffer, my name is Debra Wallet. I'm here 11 12 representing Barbara Varner in the action that she has 13 brought against the county, the court, Mr. Graham, and 14 Mr. Osenkarski. Have you ever been deposed before? 15 16 No. Α. 17 You understand that this is the time when the lawyers 0 18 will be asking you questions relative to this lawsuit. 19 Is there any reason today why you could not answer our 20 questions truthfully and completely? 21 Α. No, ma'am. 22 If at any time you do not hear my question, would you 23 please ask me to repeat it before you attempt to answer 24 that question?

I will, but please keep your voice up. I have a cold

- 1 and I have problems with my ears.
- 2 Q I'll do what I can, sir. If at any time you can't hear
- me, just stop and I'll be happy to repeat it. However,
- 4 I must have an agreement with you that if you do answer
- 5 a question, that you have both heard that question and
- 6 then that you have understood it. Is that agreed?
- 7 A. Yes, ma'am.
- 8 Q Tell me, sir, what did you do to prepare for this
- 9 deposition today?
- 10 A. I suppose I reviewed my file. Reviewed whatever counsel
- 11 sent to me.
- 12 Q Did you -- I'm sorry? Were you finished?
- 13 A. Um-hum.
- 14 Q Did you review any of the transcripts from the prior
- 15 testimony of other witnesses in this case?
- 16 A. Judge Sheely's.
- 17 Q Any others?
- 18 A. Not that I recall.
- 19 Q Did you talk to any witnesses before today in
- 20 preparation for today?
- 21 A. No, ma'am.
- 22 Q Would you tell me, sir, when you first learned that
- 23 Barbara Varner had made allegations against Joe
- Osenkarski and Gary Graham?
- 25 A. That would have been either when I took over as

- 1 president judge, or if it was earlier, it would have
- 2 been after Judge Sheely told me about his conversation
- 3 with Gary Graham, one of the two.
- 4 Q All right. Did you at some time after becoming
- 5 president judge review the allegations that she, Barbara
- 6 Varner, had made?
- 7 A. In what form, ma'am?
- 8 Q In written form.
- 9 A. You mean a Complaint?
- 10 Q Or some memorandum spelling out --
- 11 A. I don't think I saw a Complaint until after it was
- 12 filed, whenever that was.
- 13 Q And when you say a Complaint, you're speaking of the
- 14 Complaint that was filed in federal court?
- 15 A. Yes, ma'am.
- 16 Q Do you remember reviewing any memoranda that Barbara
- 17 Varner had written regarding her allegations against
- 18 Mr. Graham or Mr. Osenkarski?
- 19 A. Graham per se?
- 20 Q Yes, sir.
- 21 A. I have no recollection there, ma'am.
- 22  $\,$  Q  $\,$  When you assumed the position of president judge, and I
- 23 believe that was on January 1st of 1998; is that
- 24 correct?
- 25 A. The first Monday in January.

- 1 Q Okay. Do I have the year correct, 1998?
- 2 A. '98.
- 3 Q After you became president judge, what did you
- 4 understand the status of Ms. Varner's allegations to be
- 5 at that time?
- 6 A. I think I knew she filed a Complaint with the EEOC. Is
- 7 that the correct initials?
- 8 Q Yes, sir.
- 9 A. And I suppose that's the extent of it.
- 10 Q After you became president judge, did you do anything to
- 11 investigate the allegations that Ms. Varner had made
- 12 against Mr. Graham?
- 13 A. Yes, ma'am.
- 14 Q What did you do?
- 15 A. After I took over, I had reference to a report done by
- 16 the county. I examined that report.
- 17 Q What was your understanding of the role of the county
- 18 with regard to that report?
- 19 A. I don't understand your question.
- 20 Q Did you know whether the Court had designated someone to
- investigate these allegations?
- 22 A. The Court meaning myself or Judge Sheely?
- 23 Q Either.
- 24 A. I know I didn't, ma'am. What Judge Sheely did is best
- known to him. I don't believe so.

- 1 Q Did you at any time, sir, hire an investigator to
- 2 investigate the allegations brought by Barbara Varner?
- 3 A. No.
- 4 Q Now, this report that you had referenced that was done
- 5 by the county, is that the report done by Mr. Deluce?
- 6 A. Yes, ma'am.
- 7 Q Are you aware of any other reports done by the county to
- 8 which you had access when you became president judge?
- 9 A. No, ma'am.
- 10 Q So you reviewed this report from David Deluce. Did you
- do anything else by way of your investigation?
- MR. THOMAS: When?
- 13 BY MS. WALLET:
- 14 Q At that time when you became president judge.
- 15 A. Over a period of time, did something, yes.
- 16 Q Okay.
- 17 A. It didn't all happen in one day.
- 18 Q What did you do in response to the Deluce report?
- 19 A. Well, I know I had certain of the officers up to talk to
- them about the report.
- 21 Q Who?
- 22 A. I have a note somewhere.
- 23 Q Well, we were given some notes that were provided to us
- by your counsel, and some of these notes I'm not sure I
- 25 understand so I was going to ask you about them. If you

- 1 would like to look at what I've made as copies of these
- 2 notes and tell me which ones --
- 3 A. What you're referring to would be on one sheet with some
- 4 names on it, ma'am, on the left-hand side of the sheet.
- 5 Q All right. Would this be the sheet, sir?
- 6 A. I think so.
- 7 MS. WALLET: Let's mark for identification as
- 8 Hoffer Deposition No. 1 a couple of sheets stapled
- 9 together. I've attempted to copy them together as they
- 10 were given to me, but you may have to explain to us
- 11 whether they are related or not related.
- 12 (Hoffer Deposition Exhibit No. 1 was marked.)
- 13 MS. WALLET: I've handed the witness what we've
- 14 marked for identification as Hoffer Deposition No. 1.
- 15 BY MS. WALLET:
- 16 Q Could you go through this document, please, and tell
- me whether all of these are notes in your handwriting?
- 18 A. Exhibit 1 is in my handwriting.
- 19 Q Okay. Is that true with respect to all of the pages in
- 20 Exhibit 1?
- 21 A. They're all in my handwriting.
- 22 Q Okay. Judge, were --
- 23 A. They're not necessarily compiled in the order that I
- 24 compiled them, though, ma'am.
- 25 Q All right. Can you explain to me what these notes

10

1 reflect? 2 Well, I suppose to put them in the correct order would 3 be page 3 of this exhibit with the individual names on 4 it. 5 All right. Let's start with that one. 6 Α. And my recollection is those would have been people I 7 asked to come up to my office to talk to. Okay. There are checkmarks by some of these names. Is 8 9 there any significance to those checkmarks? 10 My recollection would be that those people actually came Α. into the office, not necessarily the others. 11 12 Did you speak to everyone on this list? 13 I can't tell you, ma'am. Α. 14 Why can't you tell us? Q Well, as I tried to tell you, if I checkmarked the name, 15 16 I believe I had them in my office to talk to them. If I 17 didn't checkmark the name, they may not have been into 18 my office to talk to me. 19 All right. If these notes were in the correct order 20 what would be the next page? 21 MR. ADAMS: Can we all agree as counsel to whatever 22 order the judge puts them in from his mind-set and the chronology of the testimony, put them in that proper 23 24 order as an exhibit? For example, just unstapled and

make this 1, 2, for whatever pages? As he goes through

- 1 them?
- MS. WALLET: Doesn't matter to me.
- 3 THE WITNESS: If that's important. I didn't hear
- 4 what he said.
- 5 MS. WILLIAMS: We could do Exhibit 1A, B, C, D, E,
- 6 would that help?
- 7 MR. ADAMS: And the way he's testifying I'd like
- 8 them in that order, that's all.
- 9 MS. WALLET: We'll label the page with the list of
- 10 names and the checkmarks as A.
- 11 THE WITNESS: Your question?
- 12 BY MS. WALLET:
- 13 Q My question is: Which page should come next?
- 14 A. It would either be the two pages marked Nick, or the one
- 15 marked Debbie Green.
- 16 Q Let's mark the first page B1 the second page B2 and the
- 17 one marked Debbie Green, C. Is that acceptable?
- 18 I take it that B1 and B2 indicate your notes from
- 19 when you spoke to Nick who?
- 20 A. That would have been Nick Barolet, I believe. It's the
- only Nick I have. And he's since left the office.
- 22 Q Who was Mr. Barolet?
- 23 A. A PO.
- 24 Q Frankly, sir, I can't read your handwriting, and I'm
- 25 hoping that you can simply read this for us before we

1		begin. Would you do that?
2	Α.	You want me to read from the top on Nick?
3	Q	Correct.
4	Α.	"Boyer doesn't know what he is doing. Good as
5		administrator. Should Tom do some cases. Debbie
6		Reitzell over her" this is from Nick Barolet " over
7		her head. Gary made lewd comments." Inartful English on
8		my part.
9		"No policies or procedures manual, no standard of
10		operations. No staff meetings. Need explanations on
11		memos." Or is that "or memos," I'm not sure. "Have
12		meetings every two months."
13		"When Graham had Nick and Varner he had different
14		standards for the both of them."
15		Page 2 of Nick. "They're doing full-blown social
16		history on informal probations. Not necessary.
17		Atmosphere is tense. Tom Boyer has different standards
18		than Gary. All standards should be the same."
19		These are suggestions made by Barolet in response
20		to my asking him for suggestions.
21	Q	All right. Are you able to pinpoint for us a date or a
22		time frame when you met with Nick Barolet?
23	Α.	The time frame would have been between the first day
24		that I took over and the date that I demoted Gary
25		Graham.

- 1 Q So sometime between January and mid March of 1998? That
- 2 was a question, sir.
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q Now, how did you arrive at the list that is contained on
- 5 page A of Deposition 1?
- 6 A. I can't be sure, ma'am.
- 7 Q Did someone suggest to you that you talk with these
- 8 people? Or was that your idea?
- 9 A. I doubt if anybody suggested it. It would have been my
- 10 idea. If anything, I got the names out of the report.
- 11 Q Okay.
- 12 A. That would have been the logical place for me to get
- 13 them.
- 14 Q At that time did you meet with Barbara Varner?
- 15 A. Her name's not on the list, so I didn't meet with her.
- 16 Q Did you meet with Gary Graham?
- 17 A. If his name's not on the list, I didn't meet with him.
- 18 Q Why didn't you meet with Barbara Varner at that time?
- 19 A. I don't understand your question, ma'am. Why didn't I
- 20 meet with her?
- 21 Q She was the one making the allegations. Why didn't you
- 22 meet with her and ask her about those allegations?
- 23 A. I met with people who I wanted to find out about what
- 24 they said in the report.
- 25 Q Were there any statements from Ms. Varner in the report?

- 1 A. I don't have any recollection about that. I suppose so,
- but I don't recollect.
- 3 MR. THOMAS: Once again, let me interpose the
- 4 objection to the report. We'll interpose our objection
- 5 to that based on attorney-client privilege and attorney
- 6 work product. And I've let you ask a couple of
- 7 questions about it without waiving that objection, but I
- 8 will object and instruct the witness not to answer
- 9 questions dealing with the content of the Deluce report.
- 10 BY MS. WALLET:
- 11 Q Judge Hoffer, was David Deluce acting as your attorney
- 12 at the time?
- 13 A. No, ma'am. No, ma'am, absolutely not.
- 14 MR. THOMAS: I would point out for the record at
- that point that the plaintiff in this case has made an
- 16 allegation that this was joint employment, and
- 17 Mr. Deluce, of course, was employed by the county. And
- 18 it's the plaintiff's allegations that contend that this
- 19 was a joint employment situation.
- 20 BY MS. WALLET:
- 21 Q Do you know whether or not Mr. Graham had made some
- 22 statements that were contained in this report?
- 23 MR. THOMAS: Again, I would object to asking this
- 24 witness questions about the content of that report and I
- would instruct him not to answer.

- 1 THE WITNESS: I don't recollect.
- MS. WILLIAMS: Your Honor, we're not going to
- answer questions about the report specifically. So
- 4 we'll wait for the next question.
- 5 THE WITNESS: All right.
- 6 BY MS. WALLET:
- 7 Q Do you consider Mr. Thomas to be your attorney today?
- 8 A. Absolutely not.
- 9 MS. WILLIAMS: I will state for the record that
- 10 because of the joint employment situation, we have
- 11 joined Mr. Thomas in the objection to the Deluce report,
- 12 and we have in the past instructed other witnesses not
- 13 to answer questions on that report and we're so doing
- 14 today.
- 15 BY MS. WALLET:
- 16 Q I'm back to the list, sir. Do I understand from what
- 17 you've testified to earlier that in or about the time
- 18 frame between January and March of 1998 you talked to
- 19 Bill Brandt, Debbie Green, Nick Barolet, Jenny Crum, is
- 20 it?
- 21 A. Looks like C-R-U-M-B.
- 22 Q C-R-U-M-B?
- 23 A. That's what it looks like to me.
- 24 Q Okay. Mrs. Rose. Anyone else?
- 25 A. I just have no way to recollect anymore, ma'am.

- 1 Q Now, you have two pages of notes about your meeting with
- 2 Mr. Barolet and we have at least one page of notes of
- 3 meetings with Debbie Green.
- 4 To the best of your knowledge, sir, are there any
- 5 other notes of meetings that took place in this time
- frame?
- 7 A. Again, ma'am?
- 8 Q To the best of your recollection, do you have any other
- 9 notes of any of your meetings with these individuals
- 10 whose names are checked?
- 11 A. Brandt, Crum and Mrs. Rose. No, ma'am. No notes.
- 12 Q Who is Jenny Crum?
- 13 A. I think she was an office secretary, but I'm not sure
- 14 about that.
- 15 Q How about Mrs. Rose?
- 16 A. Mrs. Rose, definitely an office secretary.
- 17 Q Is there a reason why you would have taken notes during
- some of these meetings and not others?
- 19 A. Well, in Barolet's case I think I knew that Nick was
- 20 leaving for another job, or had reason to believe that
- 21 he was leaving, I'm not sure. But I wanted to get ideas
- 22 from him about what changes he thought we should make
- down there for the better, and most of the notes are to
- do with that.
- 25 Q Okay. Do you recall today, sir, what Mr. Barolet told

- 1 you about the comments that caused you to make the
- 2 notation Gary made lewd comments?
- 3 A. No independent recollection of anything other than what
- 4 my note says. And remember, this was Nick reporting
- 5 something that he heard from somebody else.
- 6 Q When Nick told you that the atmosphere was tense, was
- 7 tense between whom?
- 8 A. In the office.
- 9 Q Did you do anything as a result of the statements that
- 10 you obtained from Nick Barolet?
- 11 A. Well, do you want to get specific, ma'am?
- 12 Q Well, after Mr. Barolet told you certain things, did it
- 13 cause you to take some action?
- 14 A. Later on after Gary's demotion I called a total staff
- meeting in the Human Services Building and said some
- 16 things that were on my mind, including the operation of
- 17 the office, what I expected.
- 18 Q When you say a total staff meeting, you mean with all of
- the Probation officers?
- 20 A. As far as I know, everyone was there that was in
- 21 Juvenile Probation. Certainly that was my intention to
- have everyone there.
- 23 Q Was it just the professional staff, or did it include
- the clerical staff?
- 25 A. I don't think the secretaries were there. At least I

- don't have any recollection of them being there.
- 2 Q And was it all of the probation officers, both Juvenile
- 3 and Adult?
- 4 A. Only Juvenile.
- 5 Q What, if you recall today, did you tell them at that
- 6 staff meeting?
- 7 A. Looking back on everything, ma'am, I probably should
- 8 have had a stenographer there. But I don't have too
- 9 much of an independent recollection. It was kind of a
- 10 pep talk, there were elements of that in it. There were
- 11 elements of I want everybody to pick up the professional
- 12 level. I explained some things that I didn't like that
- 13 were going on and I didn't expect them to happen again.
- 14 I do remember telling them if I have to micromanage
- this office, I'll do it, but I didn't want to do it.
- 16 That's one of the big things I remember saying. How big
- it was, I don't know.
- 18 Q Did this meeting with the staff occur before or after
- 19 you transferred Mr. Graham?
- 20 A. Oh, I think it would have been after.
- 21 Q Was Mr. Graham there?
- 22 A. No.
- 23 Q Did you say anything at this meeting about sexual
- 24 harassment?
- 25 A. I have no recollection, ma'am. I've told you the best

1		recollection I have on what I said.
2	Q	Let's go back to Deposition No. 1. Would you read for
3		us your notes concerning your conversation with Debbie
4		Green?
5		MR. ADAMS: What are we calling that?
6		MR. THOMAS: C.
7		MS. WALLET: C.
8		MR. ADAMS: Okay.
9		THE WITNESS: "Debbie Green," circle drawn around
10		it, "said Nicole was told by Graham six months ago I'll
11		get everyone back. Debbie," I guess this is was in
12		response to a similar type question I put to Nick
13		Barolet, do you have any changes down there, is there
14		anything we can do better than we're doing. Ms. Green
15		suggested that we didn't have any guidelines she
16		said, quote, "no guidelines on how to do a social
17		history." My independent note is "subject for a staff
18		meeting."
19		"Saw Gary grab Barbara's butt several years ago.
20		Has singled Barb out for trips. Office is more tense
21		with Gary around. Tom Boyer not up on placements work.
22		Says Gary must go, too tense."
23	Q	Do you believe those notes accurately reflect what
24		Ms. Green told you in that time frame?
25	Α.	I have no reason not to, ma'am. These are my notes, I

#### Hon. George Hoffer

- 2 Q Do you agree she may have told you additional things but
- 3 these are the only subjects you wrote down?
- 4 A. I don't disagree with that statement.
- 5 Q All right. Were you concerned, sir, when Debbie Green
- 6 told you that Graham apparently told Nicole that he
- 7 would get everyone back?
- 8 A. If it was true, of course.

wrote them down.

- 9 Q Did the county or the Court at that time have a policy
- 10 with regard to workplace violence?
- 11 A. Yes, ma'am.

- 12 Q Could you explain for me, did you as the president judge
- issue policies or procedures independent of the county?
- 14 A. No, ma'am.
- 15 Q What was your understanding of the applicability of the
- 16 county's policy and procedures to the probation
- 17 officers?
- 18 A. They applied.
- 19 Q Did you have the ability not to apply those policies and
- 20 procedures to the probation officers?
- 21 A. Did I have the ability to disregard the county book? Is
- that what you're asking me?
- 23 Q Yes sir.
- 24 A. No, I never felt I had.
- 25 Q I guess maybe the better word would be authority as

- 1 opposed to ability.
- 2 A. Oh.
- 3 MS. WILLIAMS: Maybe you could rephrase that
- 4 question, make it a little clearer for the judge.
- 5 BY MS. WALLET:
- 6 Q Did you believe that the probation officers were bound
- 7 by the policies issued by the county?
- 8 A. As far as the behavior is concerned, yes, ma'am.
- 9 Q Did you believe that you as the president judge had the
- 10 authority to issue different policies or contradictory
- 11 policies?
- 12 A. I would imagine I did. I would have had, since I hired
- and fired everybody.
- 14 Q Did you ever choose to do that?
- 15 A. No, ma'am.
- 16 Q You may not know, but we had the deposition this morning
- 17 of Bill Brandt. He said that you called him into your
- 18 chambers and talked with him at some length about what
- 19 was happening in the Probation office. Do you agree
- 20 with that?
- 21 A. He's on the list, he's checked. I talked to him.
- 22 Q Do you have any recollection today of what Mr. Brandt
- 23 told you in response to your questions of Mr. Brandt?
- 24 A. No, ma'am.
- 25 Q You don't remember anything that he told you?

- 1 A. I have no independent recollection of it, ma'am. I
- 2 didn't keep any notes of the meeting.
- 3 Q When did you -- well, let's finish this exhibit.
- 4 There's a fourth page that looks like for John Ward or
- 5 from John Ward?
- 6 A. Um-hum.
- 7 Q Does that appropriately go with the rest of these
- 8 documents? Or is that something different?
- 9 A. That's later.
- 10 Q Okay. Can you give me a time frame for what we'll mark
- 11 as page D?
- 12 A. This would have been shortly before I demoted Gary.
- 13 Q So after you had the conversations with Ms. Green and
- 14 Mr. Barolet?
- 15 A. Oh, yes.
- 16 Q Could you read for us what you say in D?
- 17 A. "For John Ward, what I want," full colon, "1, a new
- 18 position at jail for a supervising PO, and an office,"
- 19 at the jail.
- 20 "2, a new position in Juvenile Probation to fill
- 21 Graham's spot," dash, "even if he quits."
- 22 Q Okay. Did you prepare this document, Deposition 1 sub
- 23 D, during your meeting with Mr. Ward, or in anticipation
- of the meeting with Mr. Ward?
- 25 A. It would have been in anticipation of any meeting with

- 1 John Ward.
- 2 Q Did you, in fact, meet with him and discuss these issues
- 3 that are reflected here?
- 4 A. I'm sure I did. I don't have any recollection of it. I
- 5 don't have any notes of it. I got what I wanted.
- 6 Q All right. Why did you decide to send Mr. Graham to the
- 7 position at the jail?
- 8 A. What was your word?
- 9 Q Why?
- 10 A. I thought you said sentence.
- 11 Q Send. Let me start again. Why did you decide to send
- Mr. Graham to a position at the jail?
- 13 A. I demoted him out of the office, the Probation office,
- ma'am. He was gone.
- 15 Q My question, sir, is: Why did you do that?
- 16 A. Why did I demote him?
- 17 Q Yes, sir.
- 18 A. I lost confidence in him.
- 19 Q In what sense?
- 20 A. Well, you have the allegations of the Graham-Varner
- 21 affair. But even more importantly, I lost confidence in
- 22 his ability to lead.
- 23 Q Did he suffer a loss of pay as a result of this
- 24 demotion?
- 25 A. You'll have to ask him that, but I think he did.

- 1 Q Was that your intention?
- 2 A. The pay had nothing to do with it, ma'am.
- 3 Q Were you able to fill Mr. Graham's spot in Juvenile
- 4 Probation?
- 5 A. I think so.
- 6 Q Did you fill it?
- 7 A. I think so.
- 8 Q Do you know who you filled it with?
- 9 A. We'll have to look at the records, ma'am. I don't
- 10 remember.
- 11 Q How did you give this notice to Mr. Graham that he was
- going to be demoted?
- 13 A. What did I physically do?
- 14 Q Yes.
- 15 A. After I had made my mind up irrevocably on this, I
- 16 called him in at about quarter of 12:00 on a Monday and
- 17 told him.
- 18 Q What did you tell him?
- 19 A. I said: You're gone, take a couple days off, report to
- I think John Roller for a new job. It was short and
- 21 sweet. It wasn't sweet, but it was short.
- 22 Q Did he make any response to you?
- 23 A. Unhappiness.
- 24 Q Did you tell him at that time that this action had
- 25 anything to do with the allegations that Barbara Varner

- 1 had made?
- 2 A. I think the most I told him, ma'am, since this was a
- 3 very short meeting: You have lost my confidence.
- 4 Q You don't recall telling Mr. Graham that it had anything
- 5 to do with the Varner allegations?
- 6 A. You've heard the extent of what I remember, ma'am. It
- 7 was my intention there was not going to be any
- 8 discussion here. It was something I did and there
- 9 wasn't going to be any debate about it.
- 10 Q Now, as a result of your discussing with the individuals
- 11 listed on page A with the checkmarks, did you learn
- 12 anything about the way in which Joseph Osenkarski was
- running the office?
- 14 A. Is he mentioned in those notes?
- 15 Q I don't see his name anywhere.
- 16 A. I don't have any recollection other than what I may have
- 17 gotten out of the report.
- 18 Q Did you take any disciplinary action against Joe
- 19 Osenkarski?
- 20 A. No, ma'am.
- 21 Q Why not?
- 22 A. I didn't do it. I didn't do it, ma'am. I did not take
- any action.
- 24 Q And I said, why not?
- 25 A. Ma'am, if I didn't take any action, it was a decision I

- 1 made not to take any action.
- 2 Q Did you have a reason?
- MR. ADAMS: Objection, asked and answered.
- 4 MS. WALLET: Well, it's certainly been asked but I
- 5 don't think it's been answered.
- 6 THE WITNESS: Did I have a reason to do what,
- 7 ma'am?
- 8 BY MS. WALLET:
- 9 Q Not to take any disciplinary action against
- 10 Mr. Osenkarski.
- 11 A. Are you asking me if I've stopped beating my wife?
- 12 Q No, sir.
- MS. WILLIAMS: Can you rephrase the question to
- make it more understandable?
- 15 BY MS. WALLET:
- 16 Q Well, we know that you didn't take any disciplinary
- 17 action against Mr. Osenkarski. Correct?
- 18 A. Yes, ma'am.
- 19 Q And I'm asking you, why was there no disciplinary action
- 20 taken against him? Was it because you didn't think he
- 21 had done anything to warrant such action?
- 22 A. What was the charge, ma'am?
- 23 Q Well, there were a number of charges that Ms. Varner had
- 24 made against Mr. Osenkarski. Were you aware of those at
- 25 the time?

- Other than anything contained in the report, if 1 Α.
- 2 anything, that would have been it.
- 3 So you relied on the information in the report for a Q
- summary of the allegations of Ms. Varner?
- 5 If there's anything in there, I suppose. Α.
- 6 Q Other than sending Mr. Graham to a position at the jail,
- 7 did you take any other disciplinary action against
- 8 Mr. Graham?
- 9 We took his courthouse key away, if that's disciplinary Α.
- action. 10
- Why did you do that? 11
- 12 He didn't have any access to the courthouse anymore, he Α.
- didn't work here. 13
- Any other disciplinary action against Gary Graham? 14
- None that I can recall, that I did. 15
- 16 Was there a sexual harassment policy in place when you
- 17 came in as president judge in January, the first Monday
- in January of '98? 18
- Any harassment policy would have been contained in the 19
- 20 county manual.
- 21 Did you believe the probation officers to be bound by
- 22 that sexual harassment policy?
- 23 Yes, ma'am. Α.
- 24 Did you at any time tell Ms. Varner that she had failed
- 25 to follow the sexual harassment policy that was in

- 1 place?
- 2 Α. No.
- 3 0 Sir, as an employer or supervisor, have you had any
- prior experience with sexual harassment claims?
- 5 Α. In my life?
- 6 Q. Yes, sir.
- 7 What do you mean experience, ma'am? I've read things in
- 8 the paper, I've read books, I've read government
- 9 policies.
- My question was while you were an employer or a 10
- 11 supervisor, did you have any experience with any sexual
- 12 harassment claims?
- 13 Α. No. I'm not aware of anything like that.
- Were you aware that there was an allegation of sexual 14
- harassment brought by Kerry Houser against 15
- 16 Mr. Osenkarski in the early '90s?
- Oh, I have some vague recollection of that somehow. 17 Α.
- 18 Somehow, somewhere.
- Do you believe that you knew that that charge or 19
- 20 allegation had been made when you conducted your
- 21 interviews that are reflected in Deposition 1?
- Would I have known about it at that time? 22 Α.
- 23 Yes, sir. Q
- 24 Α. I don't have any recollection of that, ma'am.
- 25 After you demoted Mr. Graham, did you do anything else

- 1 with regard to the allegations that Ms. Varner had made
- 2 against Gary Graham?
- 3 MR. THOMAS: You mean other than the earlier
- 4 testimony he gave?
- 5 MS. WALLET: Correct.
- 6 THE WITNESS: No.
- 7 BY MS. WALLET:
- 8 Q Did you consider the matter to be closed at that time?
- 9 MR. ADAMS: Objection as to form. What do you mean
- 10 by closed?
- 11 BY MS. WALLET:
- 12 Q Did you think it was done and over?
- 13 A. Ma'am, I knew that an EEOC Complaint had been filed. It
- 14 could have hardly been over.
- 15 Q Did you believe that you had any further obligation to
- investigate Ms. Varner's allegations?
- 17 A. On my own?
- 18 Q Yes, sir.
- 19 A. I did not do that, ma'am.
- 20 Q My question was: Did you feel you had an obligation to
- 21 do anything further?
- 22 A. On my own? No.
- 23 Q Yes, sir.
- 24 A. No.
- 25 Q Sir, what do you know about the use of seniority for

- 1 purposes of promotion within the Probation office at the
- time that you became president judge?
- 3 A. Zero.
- 4 Q Did you subsequently learn something about the seniority
- 5 issue?
- 6 A. I have no recollection, ma'am.
- 7 Q Did you have any discussions with anyone about seniority
- 8 county-wide versus that in the Probation office?
- 9 MR. THOMAS: Objection to the form. You may
- 10 answer.
- 11 THE WITNESS: I have no recollection.
- 12 BY MS. WALLET:
- 13 Q Did you have any discussions with Mr. Osenkarski about
- 14 the use of seniority for promotions within the Probation
- 15 office?
- 16 A. I don't have any recollection of that, ma'am.
- 17 Q Did you have any discussions with Tom Boyer about that?
- 18 A. I don't remember anything there, either.
- 19 Q Did Ms. Varner bring to your attention the issue of the
- use of seniority?
- 21 A. In what fashion did she bring it to my attention?
- 22 Q I'm asking you, do you remember having anything brought
- 23 to your attention by Ms. Varner about the seniority
- 24 issue?
- 25 A. As we sit here, no.

1	MS.	WALLET:	Let's	mark	as	Deposition	No.	2?

- 2 (Discussion held off the record.)
- 3 (Hoffer Deposition Exhibit No. 2 was marked.)
- 4 MR. DELLASEGA: This is Exhibit 2?
- 5 MS. WALLET: It is.
- 6 BY MS. WALLET:
- 7 Q Are you ready, sir?
- 8 A. Yes, ma'am.
- 9 Q I've handed you what we've marked for identification as
- 10 Deposition Exhibit 2. Your name appears on the second
- 11 page of that document.
- Have you had a chance to look at it?
- 13 A. I glanced over it, yes.
- 14 Q Do you recall having received this document in or around
- 15 March of 1991?
- 16 A. No, ma'am.
- 17 Q Do you have any reason to believe that you did not
- 18 receive it at that time?
- 19 A. No, ma'am.
- MR. ADAMS: Correction. 1998.
- MS. BLANCHARD: You said '91.
- MS. WALLET: Okay. Well, I obviously said
- something other than '98. Let's ask that question
- 24 again.
- 25 BY MS. WALLET:

- 1 Do you have any reason to believe that you didn't
- 2 receive this document in or about March of 1998?
- 3 Α. No reason one way or the other.
- Do you have any recollection of the seniority and
- 5 promotion issue, now that you've looked at the document
- 6 marked Deposition 2?
- 7 No, ma'am.
- Have you made any changes in the use of seniority for 8
- 9 promotional purposes within the Probation Office since
- 10 you became president judge?
- I'm not aware of any seniority issues. What was the 11 Α.
- 12 rest of your question?
- 13 Q My question, sir, was: Did you make any changes to the
- 14 use of seniority when you became president judge?
- 15 Well, I don't know what use was made of seniority to
- 16 begin with, ma'am, but seniority has never been high on
- 17 my books.
- 18 Okay. Is that a no, you didn't make any changes?
- MR. ADAMS: Objection, asked and answered. 19
- 20 MS. WALLET: Well, I would agree it's been asked.
- 21 THE WITNESS: I didn't change anything, if that's
- 22 your question.
- 23 BY MS. WALLET:
- 24 That's my question, sir.
- 25 I'd like to show you what has previously been

- 1 marked as Sheely Deposition No. 2, that being an April
- 2 25, 1997, memorandum from Barbara Varner to Dan
- 3 Hartnett. Would you take a minute to look at that, sir,
- 4 and tell me whether you had a copy of that in or about
- 5 March of 1998?
- 6 A. I do not recollect seeing this before.
- 7 Q Before today? Or before --
- 8 A. Ever. Ever, before ever. Before this moment, ma'am.
- 9 MS. WALLET: Okay. Let's mark as Deposition 3 a
- 10 one-page document.
- 11 (Hoffer Deposition Exhibit No. 3 was marked.)
- 12 BY MS. WALLET:
- 13 Q Sir, is that your signature in the middle of the page
- marked Deposition 3?
- 15 A. Yes, ma'am.
- 16 Q Across from the word department head?
- 17 A. Yes, ma'am.
- 18 Q And you dated that for 3/13/98?
- 19 A. I did.
- 20 Q This personnel action form, is that prepared by you or
- 21 by someone else?
- 22 A. Someone else.
- 23 Q Do you know who prepared this particular form?
- 24 A. No, ma'am.
- 25 Q I note that Dan Hartnett signed as personnel officer on

- 1 the 24th of February, a couple week before you signed
- 2 it.
- 3 Was this action a result of your initiation and
- 4 your meeting with Mr. Ward? Or had Mr. Hartnett
- 5 recommended this action to you?
- 6 A. What action? Is this the demotion?
- 7 Q Yes, it is.
- 8 A. Hartnett didn't recommend anything to me except perhaps
- 9 to fire Graham.
- 10 Q Did he recommend that he be fired?
- 11 A. I don't know. It's a possibility, I don't -- I don't
- have any recollection of that, ma'am.
- 13 Q Did you consult with anyone before you made the decision
- to transfer and demote Mr. Graham?
- 15 A. About my decision?
- 16 Q Yes, sir.
- 17 A. No, ma'am. Obviously, I consulted with --
- 18 Q John Ward?
- 19 A. -- John Ward. But I had made my decision by that time.
- 20 Q It was your decision and your decision alone?
- 21 A. Yes, ma'am.
- ${\tt Q}$  When did you learn that there was, for lack of a better
- 23 word, some tension between Barbara Varner and Barbara
- 24 Graham?
- 25 A. I suppose the beginning of '98 sometime.

- 1 Q What did you learn, sir?
- 2 A. Well, aside from what I might have just heard in the
- 3 courthouse scuttlebutt, I think I saw a note from
- 4 Ms. Varner to Dan Hartnett, the personnel director,
- 5 complaining about Ms. Graham.
- 6 Q And did you receive that from Mr. Hartnett?
- 7 A. As far as I know, everything came from Hartnett. He
- 8 copied me with various things.
- 9 Q All right.
- 10 A. That is, from Ms. Varner.
- 11 Q Yes, sir.
- 12 A. Ms. Graham's notes came directly.
- 13 Q Okay. When you learned that Ms. Varner had made
- 14 complaints about Barbara Graham, what, if anything, did
- 15 you do?
- 16 A. Nothing.
- 17 Q Did you talk to Ms. Varner about her complaints?
- 18 A. She did not ask to see me.
- 19 Q Did you speak to Ms. Varner about her complaints?
- 20 A. No, ma'am.
- 21 Q Did you speak to Barbara Graham about the issue?
- 22 A. I did.
- 23 Q And when did you do that, sir?
- 24 A. I suppose it would have been sometime between the day
- 25 that I demoted Gary until I finally had a meeting with

- 1 Ms. Varner in my office beginning of June, I believe it
- was.
- 3 And it was Barbara Graham who initiated the conversation 0
- with you? Is that correct?
- 5 Α. I can't say that. She wanted to see me to intercede on
- 6 her husband's behalf about the demotion action that I
- 7 took, and tried to see me many times on that.
- Did you see her on that issue? 8
- 9 Α. On the demotion issue?
- Yes, sir. 10 Q.
- Yes. 11 Α.
- 12 Tell me what you remember about that meeting.
- 13 Well, they would have been short, ma'am. Α.
- Was it just you and she? 14
- To my recollection, yeah. They would have been short 15
- 16 and to the effect that I did what I did and I'm not
- 17 changing anything, the demotion stands. And she wanted
- 18 to tell me her side of the story and so forth and so on.
- 19 I didn't listen to too much of that.
- 20 Do you think that the subject of the relationship
- 21 between Barbara Graham and Barbara Varner came up at
- 22 that same meeting or some later meeting?
- 23 Would you give me that again? Α.
- 24 Sure. Barbara Graham comes to you and wants to talk to
- 25 you about her husband's transfer, and you give her short

- 1 shrift and that's over. Or were there other subjects at
- 2 that meeting?
- 3 A. Well, it wasn't just one meeting, ma'am. She tried to
- 4 see me several times about this. She wouldn't give up
- 5 on it.
- 6 Q So she tried to see you several times. Did she succeed
- 7 in seeing you more than one time?
- 8 A. Yes, ma'am.
- 9 Q Okay. So the first time was she talks about the
- 10 demotion, you give her short shrift. Was that the end
- of that meeting?
- 12 A. I suppose something along those lines.
- 13 Q Did she bring up Barbara Varner at that meeting?
- 14 A. Only in the sense that she wanted me to hear Gary
- 15 Graham's side of the story through her, I suppose.
- 16 Q Did you listen to that?
- 17 A. No, ma'am.
- 18 Q So she came to your office again another time?
- 19 A. Um-hum.
- 20 Q To discuss Barbara Varner?
- 21 A. Well, that would have been later.
- 22 Q Okay. Later meaning before you met with Ms. Varner?
- 23 A. Yes, ma'am. Yeah.
- 24 Q And what did she discuss with you on that occasion?
- 25 A. I don't remember the specifics, but you didn't have to

25

taken care of.

1		be a genius to see that there was extreme antipathy
2		between these two women, and that was what it was all
3		about. And Barbara Graham mainly wanted to tell me her
4		side of the story about various incidents.
5	Q	Did you personally observe any relationship between
6		Barbara Varner and Barbara Graham?
7	Α.	Relationship?
8	Q	Did you ever observe the two of them in the same place?
9	A.	No.
10	Q	You knew about the, what you've described as antipathy
11		between the two of them because of what people told you?
12	A.	Ma'am, I knew about this lawsuit of Ms. Varner's going
13		on. You have the demotion. These people aren't
14		friends.
15	Q	Okay. Did you place some restrictions on Ms. Varner
16		with regard to where she could go within the courthouse?
17	A.	No.
18	Q	Did you call Joe Osenkarski to your courtroom or your
19		chambers and instruct him to tell Ms. Varner that she
20		had some restrictions on where she could go?
21	A.	I don't recollect, but I may have said to Joe please ask
22		Ms. Varner to stay out of the stenographers' room till
23		we get that taken care of, till we get our renovations

Q And you thought it was limited to the stenographers'

1		room?
2	Α.	I don't understand your question, ma'am.
3	Q	To the best of your recollection, what did you tell
4		Mr. Osenkarski to tell Ms. Varner?
5	Α.	Well, I think you have to understand the situation at
6		the time. Are you interested in that or not?
7	Q	Sure.
8	A.	At the particular time the old jurors' lounge on the
9		fourth floor of the courthouse used by the lawyers had
10		been used by a judge. The judge had moved out and we
11		were renovating that space for the court stenographers
12		since we had recently lost their space in the old
13		section of the courthouse. So the stenographers all had
14		to be moved into what was then occupied by Juvenile
15		Probation and perhaps some Adult Probation in there,
16		too. Ms. Varner excuse me Ms. Graham was in this
17		temporary quarters with everyone else.
18		Now, having that understanding I'm ready for your
19		question.
20	Q	Okay. And these quarters where the stenographers were,
21		is that on the third floor east wing of the courthouse?
22	Α.	They were on the third floor at that time, yes,
23		temporarily.
24	Q	You told Mr. Osenkarski to relay something to

Ms. Varner?

- 1 A. I may have said something to Joe routinely.
- 2 Q Well, what was routine about that?
- 3 A. Well, I may have asked him to have Ms. Varner, whose
- 4 office was not in this section, anyway, to stay out of
- 5 there unless we have some exchange between she and
- 6 Mrs. Graham. I thought it was routine.
- 7 Q Did you ever restrict any of your other probation
- 8 officers from entering any part of the courthouse?
- 9 A. I have not restricted any probation officer at any time
- 10 other than Gary Graham, whose card we took away.
- 11 Q So you didn't consider this a restriction on Ms. Varner?
- 12 A. I did not restrict her movements, ma'am.
- 13 Q Okay. You told Mr. Osenkarski that she should stay away
- from the stenographers' area?
- 15 A. Please stay away from the room where Barbara Graham is
- working.
- 17 Q Okay. To the best of your knowledge, did Mr. Osenkarski
- 18 carry out your instructions?
- 19 A. Well, I suspect he did, because I got a note from
- 20 Mrs. Varner that day or the very next day: Put it all
- in writing. That's what prompted me to have her up to
- my office.
- 23 Q Okay.
- 24 A. I knew we had a problem.
- MS. WALLET: Well, let me mark now as Deposition

- 1 Exhibit 4 a one-page document.
- 2 (Hoffer Deposition Exhibit No. 4 was marked.)
- 3 BY MS. WALLET:
- 4 Q Tell me, Judge, when you're ready to answer questions
- 5 about this document.
- 6 A. I am.
- 7 Q Did you receive what has been marked as Deposition
- 8 Exhibit 4 in or around June 1, 1998?
- 9 A. I think I did.
- 10 Q Now, Ms. Varner says that Joe Osenkarski told her that
- 11 she was not to conduct business in the Probation offices
- 12 located on the third floor east wing of the courthouse.
- 13 Do you have any reason to believe that that's not
- 14 what Mr. Osenkarski told Ms. Varner?
- 15 A. I have no idea what he told her, ma'am, but if I told
- 16 him, I would have made it a request.
- 17 Q Now, Ms. Varner says she wanted it in writing.
- 18 A. Um-hum.
- 19 Q And Mr. Osenkarski has already testified that he didn't
- 20 respond to this.
- 21 Did you respond in some fashion to Deposition 4?
- 22 A. I had Ms. Varner in my office the very next day, ma'am.
- 23 Q And you made notes of that meeting?
- 24 A. I did.
- 25 MS. WALLET: We'll mark as Deposition Exhibit 5 a

- 1 package of documents.
- 2 (Hoffer Deposition Exhibit No. 5 was marked.)
- 3 THE WITNESS: I wish this was a little clearer.
- 4 BY MS. WALLET:
- 5 Q Whose fault is that, your Honor?
- 6 A. Pardon me?
- 7 Q I said, whose fault is that? Clearer meaning your
- 8 handwriting or clearer meaning the copies?
- 9 A. No, the copy.
- 10 MS. WILLIAMS: Do you have a better copy?
- 11 MS. WALLET: I have the one that you gave me and I
- don't have any --
- MS. WILLIAMS: If it's clearer, maybe he could
- 14 refer to that.
- THE WITNESS: I have my original note in the
- office.
- 17 BY MS. WALLET:
- 18 Q I'll show you one that was provided to me. We'll see
- if that's a little better.
- 20 A. Not much better.
- 21 MS. WILLIAMS: Is that one a little better?
- THE WITNESS: No.
- MS. WALLET: It's about the same.
- 24 BY MS. WALLET:
- 25 Q Is what we've marked as deposition Exhibit 5 your

- 1 notes from the meeting with Ms. Varner? Α. It is. 3 0 And it consists of three pages? Α. Yes. 5 I think we can read the first page pretty well. It's 6 the second and third pages we might need some 7 interpretation on. 8 MS. WILLIAMS: Do you want us to get the original
- MR. THOMAS: Let's see if he can read it. It's not 10
- 11 that bad.

9

- BY MS. WALLET: 12
- 13 Do you think you can read this, sir? Q

from the judge's chamber?

- I'll try. 14 Α.
- Okay. Beginning at page 2, would you read that, please? 15
- 16 Dash, "explained that I wanted to eliminate as much
- contact with Barbara Graham as possible, " dash, "I'd 17
- move Barbara Graham if possible but can't." Dash, 18
- "asked Barbara Varner to voluntarily stay out of Barbara 19
- 20 Graham's office and have officers she needs to talk to
- come to her office." Dash, "she," Barbara Varner, 21
- "questioned why." Dash, "she agreed with me that 22
- 23 regardless of anything else, Barbara Graham is an
- innocent victim." 24
- Dash, "explained to Barbara Varner that I am not 25

#### Hon. George Hoffer

- 1 ordering her where or where not to go." Dash, "wanted
- 2 Barbara Varner to volunteer to do it to ease tensions.
- 3 Barbara Varner still questions why."
- "My position to Barbara Varner," colon, "I'm not
- 5 ordering her to do anything but if she still insists, I
- 6 will move any officer Barbara Varner has to see out of
- 7 that office," where Barbara Graham was, "until Barbara
- 8 Graham is relocated, " period.
- 9 Do you believe those notes accurately reflect what you 0
- told Ms. Varner on June 2nd, 1998? 10
- Absolutely. 11 Α.
- Do you have any other recollection of that meeting other 12
- 13 than what is contained in your notes?
- 14 Well, unless you refresh me with something, ma'am, these
- were the main points that I wanted to make a note of. 15
- 16 Did you tell Ms. Varner that either Mr. Osenkarski had
- 17 gotten it wrong or that she had gotten it wrong about
- 18 not being able to go to the third floor east wing at
- 19 all?
- 20 I don't remember, ma'am. And that wouldn't have been
- 21 important in my mind, either way, anyway.
- 22 Q Why not?
- 23 This was coming from me, a talk with Ms. Varner
- 24 directly.
- 25 Did you believe that you had straightened this out as a

- 1 result of this meeting with Ms. Varner?
- 2 A. Straightened what out?
- 3 Q Where Ms. Varner could go and not go.
- 4 A. I didn't --
- 5 MR. THOMAS: Objection to form.
- 6 THE WITNESS: I didn't know.
- 7 MR. THOMAS: Object to form. He can answer.
- 8 THE WITNESS: I didn't know if it was straightened
- 9 out or not, ma'am.
- 10 BY MS. WALLET:
- 11 Q Okay. Did you intend to change the instructions that
- 12 Mr. Osenkarski had given Ms. Varner?
- 13 A. What instructions?
- 14 Q That she not go anywhere on the third floor east wing of
- 15 the courthouse?
- 16 A. I don't know what instructions he gave her, ma'am. I
- 17 don't have any recollection of discussing any
- instructions from Osenkarski. Whatever they were, were
- 19 irrelevant. This is myself and Ms. Varner talking
- 20 directly about this.
- 21  $\,$  Q  $\,$  Well, let me ask you this, Judge Hoffer. Did she agree
- as a result of this meeting to what you had asked her to
- 23 do?
- 24 A. My impression was that she did not.
- 25 Q Did you give a her an order?

46

1 A. What order?

- 2 Q An order not to go to the office where Barbara Graham
- 3 was.
- 4 A. Absolutely not, ma'am.
- 5 Q So you asked her to do something, she didn't agree, and
- 6 that's --
- 7 A. I said I had the impression that she did not agree. She
- 8 never gave me a definitive answer.
- 9 Q Did you believe as a result of this meeting that she
- 10 would stay out of the stenographers' section?
- 11 A. I didn't know, ma'am. That remained to be seen whether
- she would voluntarily agree to do that or not.
- 13 Q Is it your position, sir, that she was never restricted
- 14 with regard to where she could go in the courthouse?
- 15 A. Absolutely no restrictions.
- 16 Q Did you place any similar restrictions on Barbara
- 17 Graham?
- 18 A. I haven't restricted anyone, ma'am.
- 19 Q Well, let me ask it a different way. You asked
- 20 Ms. Varner to stay out of the area where Barbara Graham
- $\,$  21  $\,$  was. Did you ask Ms. Graham to stay out of the area
- 22 where Barbara Varner was?
- 23 A. I told Ms. Graham to stay away from Ms. Varner, period.
- 24 Q And when did you tell her that?
- 25 A. Oh, that was -- I don't recollect.

1 O Well, was it before or after you had the meeting w	1	0	Well,	was	it	before	or	after	vou	had	the	meeting	with	n
--	---	---	-------	-----	----	--------	----	-------	-----	-----	-----	---------	------	---

- 2 Ms. Varner?
- 3 A. It would have been around that time, but I don't know
- 4 when.
- 5 Q Did Ms. Varner tell you that she might have some
- 6 legitimate business reasons for going to the third floor
- 7 east wing of the courthouse?
- 8 A. She did.
- 9 Q Did you believe that her reasons were legitimate?
- 10 A. My recollection was that she wanted -- she had to talk
- 11 to Debbie Green, a fellow probation officer who was over
- 12 there, and she had to talk about cases. That's what she
- 13 told me.
- 14 Q Did you doubt that?
- 15 A. No, ma'am. But it's in my notes, I said if you have to
- 16 talk about cases with Debbie Green I'll move Ms. Green
- over to the new office.
- 18 Q Did you think that it might be embarrassing for
- 19 Ms. Varner to be restricted or to have a part even that
- 20 would be off limits to her?
- MR. ADAMS: Objection.
- MS. WILLIAMS: Objection.
- 23 THE WITNESS: I did not restrict Ms. Varner's
- 24 movements, ma'am.
- 25 BY MS. WALLET:

- 1 Q Did you think it would be embarrassing to her if she
- 2 was to honor your suggestion that she not go to the
- 3 stenographers' area?
- 4 MR. ADAMS: A continuing objection. It requires
- 5 the judge to speculate as to the feelings of Ms. Varner.
- 6 BY MS. WALLET:
- 7 Q You may answer.
- 8 A. I can't read her mind, ma'am.
- 9 Q Were there other probation officers other than Ms. Green
- in that same area?
- 11 A. To my recollection, yes.
- 12 Q Who else was there?
- 13 A. I don't recollect. Ms. Green was the only one
- Ms. Varner told me she had to talk to.
- 15 Q Would you agree, sir, there were a handful, at least --
- 16 A. A what?
- 17 Q A handful, several, more than two, probation officers
- 18 located in that area at that time?
- 19 A. I think there were both perhaps Juvenile and Adult. I
- 20 don't recollect what the line-up was in there. But I
- 21 know we had stenographers in there, so that would have
- 22 cramped things a little bit.
- 23 Q Were the stenographers in exactly the same area? I
- 24 mean, is it one big room?
- 25 A. It was one large room with various smaller rooms cut off

- 1 and partitioned. I don't remember the line-up anymore.
- 2 Q Was Ms. Varner the only probation officer who didn't
- 3 have her office there?
- 4 A. Could you ask me that again, ma'am?
- 5 Q Well, we know that a number of probation officers were
- on the third floor east wing, and Ms. Varner wasn't.
- 7 Were there others, other than Ms. Varner, who did not
- 8 have their offices on the third floor east wing?
- 9 A. In Juvenile Probation?
- 10 Q Yes, sir.
- 11 A. Oh, yes. Back in the main part of the third floor in
- the old section, where they all started.
- 13 Q Do you recall whether it was about equally divided or
- more in one area than the other?
- 15 A. I can't remember the setup at that time. I know a lot
- of the Adults went in there but I don't remember when
- 17 that was anymore. Maybe that was later.
- 18 MS. WALLET: Just for the record, your Honor, would
- 19 you look at what we'll mark as Deposition Exhibit 6?
- 20 (Hoffer Deposition Exhibit No. 6 was marked.)
- 21 BY MS. WALLET:
- 22 Q Tell me when you're ready, sir.
- 23 A. I'm ready.
- 24 Q Do you remember receiving this memorandum in or around
- 25 February 11, 1998?

Hon. George Hoffer

1 Α. I thought this was a memo I referred to earlier in my

- 2 testimony.
- 3 Do you believe you received this memo along with the Q
- attachment in or around February 11, 1998?
- 5 Α. I have no reason not to believe that I got it about that
- 6 time.
- 7 MS. WALLET: Let's mark as Deposition 7 another
- 8 one-page memo.
- 9 (Hoffer Deposition Exhibit No. 7 was marked.).
- BY MS. WALLET: 10
- 11 Are you ready?
- 12 Yes, ma'am. Α.
- 13 Okay. Do you recall receiving Deposition 7 in or about 0
- March of 1998? 14
- As we sit here now, no, I don't have any independent 15
- recollection of receiving it, although some of it does 16
- look familiar. 17
- This is not directed at you or addressed to you, but do 18
- you believe you received it from Mr. Hartnett? 19
- 20 Α. I may have, I just don't recollect. Some of it looks
- 21 familiar.
- 22 Did meet with Barbara Varner on March the 4th of 1998?
- 23 I have no recollection of meeting with her on March 4,
- 24 ma'am.
- MS. WALLET: Well, let's mark as Deposition 8 some 25

## Hon. George Hoffer

- 1 additional handwritten notes that were provided by your
- counsel.
- 3 (Hoffer Deposition Exhibit No. 8 was marked.)
- BY MS. WALLET:
- 5 Are these your notes, sir?
- 6 Α. They are.
- 7 I can't really tell what the date is.
- 8 3-4-98. Α.
- 9 Okay. Do you recall having a meeting with Barbara
- 10 Varner on --
- Now that you've showed me this note, yes. 11
- 12 Okay. And do you believe that you met with Ms. Varner
- 13 on the 4th because you had received the March 3rd, 1998,
- memo? Which we've marked as Deposition 7. 14
- I don't know if it was a response to that, but I did 15
- 16 know I wanted to find out how the supervision with Sam
- 17 Miller was going.
- And did you call Ms. Varner to your chambers? 18
- Probably, but I don't know. 19
- 20 Q Do you remember why you had the meeting that was
- 21 documented 3/4/98?
- To find out how the supervision with Sam Miller was 22
- 23 going and any other complaints she had.
- 24 And for the record, would you just read what is
- 25 contained on this document, Deposition 8, under the

#### Hon. George Hoffer

1 words Barb Varner?

- 2 Α. "Supervision by Miller is going okay, but Graham's heavy
- 3 hand is pervasive through the office through little
- 4 things."
- 5 Does that reflect what Ms. Varner told you on March 4,
- 6 1998?
- 7 It would have. Α.
- 8 Do you remember what she told you?
- 9 Other than what I have in my notes, no, ma'am. Α.
- Did you take any action as a result of your meeting with 10
- 11 Ms. Varner on the 4th of March, 1998?
- 12 Well, Gary Graham was demoted about 10 days later. Α.
- 13 Did you do it as a result of your meeting with Q
- Ms. Varner? 14
- No. Not solely, no. 15
- Did you do anything to investigate any of the 16 0
- 17 allegations that Ms. Varner had made in the attachment
- to Deposition 6 and Deposition 7? 18
- 19 Α. No.
- 20 Did you instruct Mr. Osenkarski prior to your demoting
- 21 Mr. Graham to take any action to monitor Mr. Graham's
- 22 activities?
- To monitor Graham's activities? 23 Α.
- 24 Q.
- A. After I demoted him? 25

#### Hon. George Hoffer

- 1 Before you demoted him.
- 2 Α. No. I don't think before, no.
- 3 You agree that Mr. Osenkarski was responsible as
- 4 Mr. Graham's supervisor at that time?
- 5 MR. ADAMS: Object. What do you mean by
- 6 responsible?
- 7 MS. WALLET: Well, I'll ask a different question.
- BY MS. WALLET: 8
- 9 There's no question, is there, sir, that
- Mr. Osenkarski was the direct supervisor of Mr. Graham 10
- 11 until such time as you demoted him and sent him to the
- 12 prison?
- 13 No question in my mind, ma'am.
- Did you at any time tell Mr. Osenkarski to keep an eye 14
- 15 on Mr. Graham, particularly with regard to the tension
- in the office with Ms. Varner? 16
- 17 I may have. I don't have any recollection, ma'am.
- 18 Did you believe that by sending Mr. Graham to the
- 19 prison, that he would not have any contact with
- 20 Ms. Varner that?
- 21 That's awfully broad, ma'am. I knew he wouldn't have
- 22 any contact with Ms. Varner in the courthouse anymore.
- 23 Outside of the courthouse, I can't say.
- 24 Did you at any time ever tell Mr. Graham to stay away
- 25 from Ms. Varner?

## Hon. George Hoffer

1 Α. No.

- 2 0 Now, you learned, did you not, that there was a training
- 3 session at which Mr. Graham and Ms. Varner were both in
- 4 attendance?
- 5 In regard to the DUI school?
- 6 Q Yes, sir.
- Yes, ma'am. Α.
- And how did you learn that Ms. Varner had once again 8
- 9 complained about her interaction with Mr. Graham?
- I think she wrote a note after the session was over. 10
- 11 And that came to your attention?
- 12 Yes, ma'am. I wrote her a note back.
- 13 MS. WALLET: Let's mark as Exhibit 9 a one-page
- letter from you to Ms. Varner. 14
- (Hoffer Deposition Exhibit No. 9 was marked.) 15
- BY MS. WALLET: 16
- Can you identify for us Deposition 9? 17
- My letter ma'am to Mr. Graham. 18 Α.
- 19 Q. Why did you write that letter?
- 20 I wrote it in response to her note to John Ward.
- 21 Did you as a result of her note to you ever call
- 22 Mr. Graham in, tell him to stay away from Ms. Varner?
- As a result of what? 23 Α.
- 24 As a result of her complaint about having to be at the
- 25 same place as Mr. Graham. Did you call Mr. Graham in

- 1 and tell him to stay away from Ms. Varner?
- 2 Α. I don't have any recollection whether I did or not.
- 3 This was a routine meeting, ma'am.
- 4 After February of 1999 did you ever give any
- 5 instructions to Mr. Graham regarding his relationship
- 6 with Ms. Varner?
- Α. After?
- February of '99, the date of your letter. 8
- 9 Α. Did I give him any what?
- Instructions regarding his relationship with Ms. Varner. 10
- No, ma'am . 11 Α.
- 12 MS. WALLET: Let's mark as Deposition 10 a one-page
- 13 document.
- 14 (Hoffer Deposition Exhibit No. 10 was marked.)
- BY MS. WALLET: 15
- Sir, what we've marked as Deposition 10 was also 16
- provided by your counsel. Can you tell me what this 17
- note refers to? 18
- 19 Α. That would have preceded what you gave me as Deposition
- No. 8, ma'am. 20
- You agree there's no date on this? 21
- 22 No, but it would have been shortly before March 4, or
- 23 3/4/98.
- 24 Okay. And Deposition 10 was simply a note to yourself
- to call Ms. Varner in? 25

#### Hon. George Hoffer

1 Α. Um-hum.

- 2 0 And for the record, could you read me the part after
- 3 call Varner in with or without attorney?
- 4 Α. Dash, "how are things going," question mark, question
- 5 mark, for me to ask her. I said "Judge Sheely took," or
- 6 I wanted to say to her "Judge Sheely took steps last
- 7 summer, has" the steps, "has it been resolved."
- 8 Do you recall whether you asked Ms. Varner has this been
- 9 resolved? When you met with her on the 4th.
- Well, that would have been then her response: Graham's 10 Α.
- 11 heavy hand is still pervasive.
- 12 What's the 6269 reference, do you know what that is? 0
- 13 No. I don't have any idea what that is. Α.
- You don't think that has any significance at all to this 14
- 15 case?
- I don't know. It might be an extension number of a 16 Α.
- 17 telephone. I have no idea what it is.
- Now, in March of 2002 there was a bomb scare in the 18 Q
- 19 building. Do you recall that?
- 20 Α. Vaguely.
- 21 In fact, I think you had a couple, did you not?
- 22 I think so. Α.
- 23 Q. How did you learn that Ms. Varner had been left in the
- 24 building and was not evacuated as part of that bomb
- 25 scare?

#### Hon. George Hoffer

1 I think she wrote a letter to someone.

- 2 0 Do you think she wrote a letter to you?
- 3 Α. I don't know if it was to me or to John Ward, personnel,
- what it was. I remember seeing something.
- 5 MS. WALLET: Well, we'll mark this as Deposition
- 6 11.
- 7 (Hoffer Deposition Exhibit No. 11 was marked.)
- THE WITNESS: Do you have a question? 8
- BY MS. WALLET: 9
- My question, sir, is: Did you receive this memo 10
- 11 perhaps without the handwritten part, in or about March
- 12 27, 2002?
- 13 I suspect I did.
- Did you take -- well, let me ask you, this is not your 14
- 15 handwriting at the bottom, correct?
- That is correct, it is not. 16 Α.
- 17 And do you believe that the memo had no handwriting on
- 18 it at the time you received it?
- I don't remember. 19 Α.
- 20 Now, she says in March of 2002: As you know, in the
- 21 past you have restricted me from that office.
- 22 Did you make any response to that memo to clarify
- 23 that you never restricted her?
- 24 I never restricted her, ma'am. I didn't think I needed
- 25 to respond to something like that.

- 1 What did you do in response to this March 27, 2002,
- 2 memo?
- 3 Α. I think I got ahold of Osenkarski and said: What's
- 4 going on, do we have a policy. I don't recollect, but I
- 5 think I did get ahold of Osenkarski. I said: Take
- 6 steps to see this doesn't happen again. Something along
- 7 that line.
- 8 Okay. Do you know whether he did?
- I think he did. 9 Α.
- What do you think he did? 10
- 11 Α. Oh, I think I saw a policy come out of there sometime
- 12 after that.
- 13 Did you have a previous that policy? Q
- As far as initialling it or something? If there was a 14
- 15 policy, it was all right with me.
- She suggests in her memo of March 27, 2002, that she try 16 0
- 17 temporarily working in the east wing Probation Office.
- 18 Apparently that was the suggestion of Ms. Miller.
- 19 Did you have any discussions with Ms. Miller about
- 20 this?
- I have no recollection of that. 21 Α.
- 22 Did you play any role in the subsequent move of
- Ms. Varner to the east wing Probation Office? 23
- 24 Oh, well, if she was moved I would have played some role
- in it, in okaying it. 25

#### Hon. George Hoffer

1 Do you know who suggested that she move?

- 2 Α. No, ma'am.
- 3 Was it your suggestion that she move?
- 4 Α. No, I don't remember.
- 5 MS. WALLET: Let's mark as Deposition 12 an April
- 6 5, 2005, memo.
- 7 (Hoffer Deposition Exhibit No. 12 was marked.)
- MS. WALLET: I've handed the witness what we've 8
- 9 marked as Deposition 12.
- BY MS. WALLET: 10
- 11 Specifically I want to call your attention to
- 12 paragraph 5, maybe these where I got 2005. According to
- 13 Ms. Miller's memo, an official request has been made to
- President Judge Hoffer to move Ms. Varner's office. 14
- 15 Does that refresh your recollection as to where
- this suggestion came from? 16
- 17 No, other than looking at the paper.
- 18 Don't have any recollection that someone from the county
- 19 requested that you do this?
- 20 Α. I don't have any recollection about the move much at
- all, ma'am. 21
- 22 Did you go to the east wing to take a look at the
- 23 quarters before you approved Ms. Varner going there?
- 24 East wing? Who did she move in with? Or did she move
- 25 in by herself? I'm trying to remember.

- Gail Schuhart? 1
- 2 Α. Oh, well, she moved in with Ms. Schuhart. I guess I
- 3 would have gone down, I think I went down to the office
- to see if it was big enough and to see if Ms. Schuhart
- 5 could operate with somebody else in there.
- Did you ever do that when someone else asked to move 6 Q
- 7 their office?
- I may have. I don't recollect. 8 Α.
- 9 Is it your policy to check out the quarters before you 0
- approve a move? 10
- 11 Α. My policy?
- 12 Practice, maybe. 0
- 13 You have to remember, ma'am, I was being sued at this
- point by Ms. Varner. Do you have a question? 14
- 15 Well, the question was: Do you normally do this, or was
- 16 this unusual?
- 17 It is not unusual to find me in any office of any of the
- Probation offices, or any office in the courthouse, as 18
- 19 far as that goes.
- 20 Q Did the fact that Ms. Varner had a lawsuit pending at
- 21 that time cause you to act differently?
- 22 Differently only in the respect that there was not going
- 23 to be any further action on my part, if I could help it,
- 24 to be part of that lawsuit anymore.
- 25 Ultimately you did approve this move?

#### Hon. George Hoffer

- 1 A. If she moved, I guess I would have approved it.
- 2 Q When you became president judge did you think that Judge
- 3 Sheely had taken care of these incidents between
- 4 Ms. Varner and Mr. Graham?
- 5 A. I had no idea, ma'am.
- 6 MR. ADAMS: Objection to the form.
- 7 BY MS. WALLET:
- 8 Q What did Judge Sheely tell you about what he had done
- 9 and why he had done it?
- 10 A. When he told me, I don't remember. That would have been
- late, late in his term, I suspect, or perhaps about the
- 12 time I took over.
- 13 You're asking me -- why don't you give me that in
- 14 pieces, ma'am.
- 15 Q Okay. What did Judge Sheely tell you that he had done?
- 16 A. I think he gave Gary Graham a three-day suspension.
- 17 Q Did he tell you that he had suspended him without pay?
- 18 A. I don't remember.
- 19 Q Did Judge Sheely tell you that he thought there was an
- 20 affair between Ms. Varner and Mr. Graham?
- 21 A. I know he told me Gary confessed to an affair in front
- of him with his wife. I remember him telling me that.
- 23 Q Did you have any evidence, sir, that there was an affair
- or a sexual relationship between Gary Graham and Barbara
- 25 Varner?

- 1 Α. Any independent evidence?
- 2 0 Yes, sir.
- 3 Α. I didn't even know the allegations were going on until I
- 4 took over as PJ, and I have no evidence.
- 5 Did Judge Sheely tell you that he had taken care of
- 6 this?
- Are you asking me if he said those words?
- 8 Or something to that effect.
- I don't remember his exact words, but I know that he 9 Α.
- said a three-day suspension for Gary Graham. 10
- 11 After you learned that the EEOC charge was pending, did
- 12 you take any action to try to resolve the matter?
- 13 Α. In what way?
- 14 Q. In any way.
- Well, I didn't have Ms. Varner and Mr. Graham into the 15
- office to sit down and try to mediate something, if 16
- 17 that's what you're saying, absolutely not. There was a
- 18 lawsuit filed, ma'am. It's going to take its course.
- 19 Q. Did you have any knowledge at any time, sir, that
- 20 Mr. Osenkarski made reference to something called the
- 21 cunt club?
- 22 If that was in the report of Deluce, yes.
- And if not? 23 Q.
- 24 Well, I'm trying to recall now, and I don't have any
- 25 recollection. Perhaps if you showed me something. But

## Hon. George Hoffer

1 that's my answer.

- 2 Is there, sir, at times, disputes between the county --
- 3 MS. WILLIAMS: Could you repeat that?
- 4 BY MS. WALLET:
- 5 Is there at times disputes between the county and your
- office as to how probation officers should be treated 6
- 7 with regard to terms and conditions of employment?
- I still didn't hear that. Is there a dispute between 8 Α.
- 9 myself and the county about what?
- About terms and conditions as they apply to probation 10
- 11 officers.
- 12 MS. WILLIAMS: Did you hear the question, Judge?
- 13 THE WITNESS: Yeah.
- There's no dispute. There might be arguments, but 14
- I do the hiring and firing, ma'am. I'm in charge of the 15
- Probation Office. 16
- 17 BY MS. WALLET:
- Is there a dispute currently over whether or not a 18
- 19 probation officer is permitted to take time off with
- 20 pay?
- 21 Oh, one of the boys had been in to see me, yeah, and I
- 22 guess he's fighting with Human Services.
- 23 Someone made a request to you for some vacation time
- 24 which you approved, correct?
- Verbally, yeah. I haven't done anything in writing. I 25 Α.

#### Hon. George Hoffer

1 may have, too. I don't know.

- 2 And that individual was told by the county human
- 3 resources department that he couldn't take the time off?
- 4 Correct?
- 5 Α. That's what he told me. I don't have any dealings with
- 6 the county directly on this myself. You're referring to
- 7 Greg Richardson, I believe. Or someone else?
- 8 Who will make the determination about that case, you or
- 9 the county?
- 10 About what?
- 11 About that case, the Richardson case.
- 12 To give you the short answer, I don't know until I look
- 13 at it a little deeper. Vacation policy may be a little
- bit different than the question of me hiring and firing, 14
- which is basic, for example, I don't set the hours that 15
- 16 the courthouse is open, the commissioners do. And the
- 17 probation officers work under those hours by and large
- 18 unless they're working independently, which some of them
- 19 do. It's the nature of the job. So that's the best I
- 20 can tell you.
- 21 Who controls the budget for the payment of your
- probation officers? 22
- 23 Α. The county writes the checks, ma'am.
- 24 Who controls the budget for your staff?
- 25 MR. THOMAS: Are you asking him who writes the

1 paycheck? 2 MS. WALLET: Yes, sir. 3 THE WITNESS: We prepare a budget, the court 4 administrator and myself. We try to get it approved by 5 the county commissioners. 6 What's your question, ma'am? 7 MS. WALLET: Maybe this is a good spot. We've had a request to take a break. Let's take a break for 10 8 minutes? 9 MR. ADAMS: How about five? 10 11 (Recess taken from 3:42 until 3:50 p.m.) 12 BY MS. WALLET: 13 Judge Hoffer, is it accurate to say that it is the county that controls the budget for the probation 14 15 officers? The county sets the budget, ma'am. Probation is one of 16 Α. 17 the departments that they said a budget for. We prepare 18 a Probation budget and we go to them with our request. 19 Q. What happens if they turn you down? 20 Α. There are five votes, ma'am. If I have the votes, I get

it. If I don't have the votes, I don't get them.

Do you agree, sir, that you do not have access to any

independent sources of funding except through the county

24 for the Probation Office?

21

22

23

I have a very small fee, supervision fee. 25

- 1 And what is that, sir?
- 2 Α. Money received from supervision fees.
- 3 So that when a convicted individual is supervised or --
- 4 Α. I think that's the way it goes.
- 5 Okay. Do you have any access to any other monies
- 6 besides grant monies to fund the Probation Office?
- No, ma'am. Α.
- When you learned what happened during the bomb scare, 8
- 9 did you give any consideration to disciplining
- Mr. Osenkarski? 10
- 11 Α. No, ma'am.
- 12 Why not? 0
- 13 I didn't see that anybody had done anything wrong other
- than through an honest error. 14
- Who did you talk to before you reached that conclusion? 15
- I didn't talk to anybody. 16
- 17 MS. WALLET: That's all the questions I have.
- 18 MR. THOMAS: Can we change places so the judge can
- 19 hear?
- 20 MS. WALLET: Sure.
- 21 BY MR. DELLASEGA:
- 22 Good afternoon, Judge. I'm Paul Dellasega and I
- represent the county. I'd like to clarify a couple of 23
- 24 your answers, if I could.
- 25 Α. Could you keep your voice up?

- 1 Yes, sir. I'd like to clarify a couple of your answers,
- 2 if we can, Judge.
- 3 Other than this case, since you've been the
- 4 employer, have you had to deal with any other
- 5 allegations of adultery between your employees?
- 6 Α. No.
- 7 Do you approve of adultery between your employees?
- 8 Between employees? Α.
- 9 Q. Correct.
- 10 Α. No.
- 11 In your experience, Judge, have you dealt with other
- 12 cases or been aware of other adulterous situations that
- 13 have resulted in hard feelings?
- 14 I suppose so. Α.
- In this particular case, when Judge Sheely told you 15
- there was an allegation of adultery between Ms. Varner 16
- 17 and Mr. Graham and told you that Mr. Graham had
- 18 confessed in front of his wife, what effect did you give
- 19 the fact Mr. Graham had confessed in front of his wife?
- 20 Α. I don't know that I gave it any effect.
- In deciding what to do about the Graham and Varner 21
- 22 situation, did the fact that Mr. Graham had confessed to
- 23 adultery in front of his wife influence your ultimate
- 24 decision?
- I don't -- not per se, I don't think so, no. 25

25

68

1 Would you have treated Mr. Graham differently if you 2 felt there had not been adultery and he had simply been 3 a pure sexual harasser? 4 MS. WALLET: Objection to the form of the question. 5 I don't think that this witness ever admitted that he 6 considered this to have been an adulterous relationship. 7 THE WITNESS: It is incorrect for a supervisor to have any kind of affair with a person that he or she is 8 9 supervising. Absolutely wrong, consensual or otherwise. So what's your question? 10 BY MR. DELLASEGA: 11 12 The reason that you just articulated the me, that it 13 is incorrect for a supervisor to engage in adultery with 14 an employee --Or any kind of relationship, sexual. 15 Is that the reason why you demoted Mr. Graham in 16 addition to his management deficiencies? 17 18 That was part of it. Α. 19 Q What was the --20 The relationship, yes. Α. 21 What was the other part of it, judge? 22 I had lost my confidence in his ability to be a 23 supervisor.

And when you say that, Judge, are you referring to his

management skills?

25

1	Α.	Absolutely.
2	Q	Okay. And did you learn about his management
3		deficiencies through these interviews you conducted that
4		are outlined in Exhibit 1?
5	A.	Through the report and through all the people that I
6		talked to, yes.
7	Q	Okay. And when you considered what to do about this
8		case, Judge, did you rely on Mr. Deluce's opinions or
9		upon your own conclusions?
10	Α.	Well, I drew upon Deluce's report, yes, verified to some
11		extent by my interviews with the various people.
12	Q	Did you use the Deluce report for the factual
13		information it contained or for Mr. Deluce's opinions
14		expressed in the report?
15		MS. WALLET: Objection. I'm going to note my
16		objection for the record. I don't think you can lead
17		this witness. There is no reason why you can conduct
18		this cross-examination. He is simply a witness to be
19		deposed.
20		MR. DELLASEGA: It's a discovery deposition. I can
21		ask him any question I want to ascertain information.
22		Whether the question is admissible at trial may depend
23		on the form of the question, but there's no rule against

leading your own witness, if indeed, he is my own

witness. And that is a contention in this case.

- 1 MS. WALLET: And I'm objecting to the form of the
- 2 question.
- 3 MR. ADAMS: I need to also add that the judge is
- 4 not only a witness but he's actually a party in the
- 5 litigation, which probably gives Mr. Dellasega a little
- 6 bit more leeway to ask any kind of question, the mere
- 7 fact that he's a party.
- MS. WILLIAMS: He's a representative of a party. 8
- 9 MR. ADAMS: Thank you.
- THE WITNESS: Where are we? 10
- 11 BY MR. DELLASEGA:
- 12 You still have to answer my question, Judge.
- 13 THE WITNESS: Yes?
- MS. WILLIAMS: Yes. Could you repeat the question, 14
- Mr. Dellasega. 15
- BY MR. DELLASEGA: 16
- 17 Judge, when you decided what to do about this case did
- 18 you reach your own conclusions and act only on those
- 19 conclusions, or did you act also on the opinion of
- 20 others?
- 21 I acted on the factual opinion of others in making up my
- 22 mind what the facts were. Then I acted.
- You referred in one of the exhibits to Barbara Graham as 23 Q
- 24 an innocent victim?
- 25 Α. That was in my meeting with Mrs. Varner.

- 1 Why did you consider Barbara Graham an innocent victim?
- 2 Α. No matter what version is true, of Mrs. Varner's
- 3 statement and Gary Graham's statement, Mrs. Graham is in
- the middle on it. She loses any way it comes out.
- 5 Mrs. Varner agreed with me on that.
- 6 Q When Mrs. Graham attempted to talk to you, do you
- 7 recall, did she appear distraught?
- 8 Α. She talked to me several times and usually she was
- 9 distraught, yes. Mrs. Graham, you said?
- 10 Mrs. Graham, yes.
- 11 Α. Yes.
- 12 Did Mrs. Graham indicate to you that she felt
- 13 Mrs. Varner was a home wrecker?
- I don't remember those words. She mostly wanted me to 14
- hear the other side of it. 15
- Did she indicate any words that were similar to that? 16 0
- 17 I have no recollection of anything like that.
- 18 In your note you indicate Mrs. Varner did not oppose
- 19 your statement that Mrs. Graham was an innocent victim?
- 20 Α. Yes. That's what I made a note of in my visit with her.
- 21 As I understand, Judge, there is a salary board in this
- 22 county?
- 23 Α. There is.
- 24 And when you were referring to votes, were you referring
- 25 to the votes of the salary board?

## Hon. George Hoffer

1 I suppose the salary board -- yeah. Now that you

- 2 refreshed me, it is the salary board that we have the
- 3 votes. I don't have a vote on the budget per se.
- 4 As I understand, the salary board is the three
- 5 commissioners and the controller?
- 6 Α. Three commissioners, controller, and the department
- 7 head.
- And the department head would be the row officer 8
- 9 involved; is that right?
- Or the judge with judicial matters. 10
- 11 Okay. So in the situation where a department head feels
- 12 there's the need for an additional position in his
- 13 department, that would have to be approved by the salary
- board; is that correct? 14
- 15 Yes. Α.
- 16 All right. And in that event, the department head sits 0
- 17 as the fifth vote?
- 18 Yes. Α.
- 19 And when you feel the need for an additional court
- 20 position, you sit as the fifth vote on the salary board
- 21 to determine whether or not that court position should
- 22 be created?
- 23 Α. That's my recollection. Yes.
- 24 And when the salary for that position is set, you also
- 25 sit as the fifth vote; is that correct?

## Hon. George Hoffer

- 1 On the pay per se? I guess, but I'm a little more vague
- 2 on that.
- 3 If the salary board consists of five people and there
- are three commissioners, the commissioners would always
- 5 have the majority vote on the salary board?
- 6 Α. Is that a question?
- 7 Yes. Three is a majority of five?
- Obviously, they would. 8
- 9 All right. Other than the commissioners' ability to Q.
- control the creation of jobs and the salaries set for 10
- 11 the jobs, do you control all the other terms and
- 12 conditions of employment for your court employees?
- 13 I think so, yes.
- As a consequence of the allegation of adultery, 14
- Mr. Graham has received negative consequences? 15
- Negative what? 16 Α.
- 17 Has received negative consequences in the form of a
- 18 demotion. Can you identify any negative consequence
- 19 Mrs. Varner has received?
- 20 Α. She's denied everything. I don't know of any negative
- 21 consequence towards her.
- 22 You have imposed no negative consequence?
- 23 Α. No. On her, no.
- 24 Even though she is accused of adultery, you have
- 25 attempted to accommodate her complaints?

- 1 She has denied everything.
- 2 0 I understand that, Judge. Having denied the
- 3 allegations, you have still -- let me rephrase it.
- 4 In your own mind have you reached a conclusion as
- 5 to whether or not adultery took place?
- 6 Α. I have no -- I don't have to make that decision, sir,
- 7 and I have not made it.
- All right. 8 0
- 9 That will play out in a court of law. Α.
- All right. Having left that as an open issue, 10
- 11 Mr. Graham has been demoted but nothing has happened to
- 12 Mrs. Varner?
- 13 I think I just said that.
- Right. And in fact, you have attempted, even though 14
- 15 it's an open issue, to accommodate Mrs. Varner with the
- complaints that she has expressed over the years; is 16
- 17 that right?
- 18 Well, yes, I think so. We've promoted her. Α.
- 19 Judge, if you have two probation officers and one is
- 20 slightly senior to the other, and a junior probation
- 21 officer is the better qualified employee, which will you
- 22 consider for promotion?
- 23 Α. Quality. Qualifications, absolutely.
- 24 Within the Cumberland County bench, Judge, does
- 25 Mrs. Graham have a reputation for truthfulness?

- 1 MS. WILLIAMS: Did you hear the question, Judge?
- THE WITNESS: Yeah, I heard the question. You're
- 3 asking me if I know Mrs. Graham's reputation?
- 4 BY MR. DELLASEGA:
- 5 Q For truthfulness.
- 6 A. For truthfulness. While I'm a judge I don't think
- 7 you're asking a reputation question in a proper fashion,
- 8 but you're asking it, sir, do I know her reputation.
- 9 Q For truthfulness.
- 10 A. As far as the cases that she presents in front of me, I
- 11 think she presents them in a truthful manner. That's
- 12 the only way I see her. She presents Juvenile cases in
- front of me.
- MS. WILLIAMS: Did you understand the question,
- 15 Judge?
- Did you get the response you wanted, Paul?
- 17 MR. THOMAS: It was clear that he meant Varner, I
- think.
- 19 MS. WILLIAMS: Okay. But is the record clear?
- 20 BY MR. DELLASEGA:
- 21 Q What I was asking you was with regard to Barbara
- 22 Graham?
- 23 A. Barbara Graham?
- 24 Q Yes, not Mrs. Varner.
- 25 A. I thought you just asked me about Mrs. Varner.

#### Hon. George Hoffer

1 Q. No, no.

- 2 Α. I didn't hear you correctly, then.
- 3 Maybe I misspoke. With regard to Barbara Graham, my
- 4 question to you is: Within the bench of Cumberland
- 5 County, does she have a reputation for truthfulness?
- 6 Α. I think so, yes.
- 7 When you met with your staff and told them if necessary
- 8 you would micromanage the office, and by staff I mean
- 9 the Juvenile Probation Department, were you referring to
- anything other than the leadership deficiencies you had 10
- 11 identified in these interviews?
- 12 Leadership, primarily, and the overall tenor of the
- office and the working relationships. 13
- When Judge Sheely handed over the reins of office to you 14
- and communicated to you about the Varner-Graham problem, 15
- did he tell you whether or not there had been an affair? 16
- 17 He told me that Gary confessed to him in front of his Α.
- wife in his office that there had been an affair. 18
- 19 That's what he told me.
- 20 Q. Did he tell you that he believed there had been an
- affair? 21
- 22 I don't remember whether he believed it or disbelieved
- 23 it or whether he took a position.
- 24 MR. DELLASEGA: That's all. Thank you, Judge.
- 25 MR. ADAMS: I have no questions.

21

22

23

#### Hon. George Hoffer

- 1 MS. BLANCHARD: I have a couple questions. 2 BY MS. BLANCHARD: 3 Judge, my name is Kristin Blanchard and I represent Gary Graham. I'll try to speak up, I know I'm all the way down here at this end. 6 Did you talk to Gary Graham before you demoted him 7 about the reasons for the demotion? No, ma'am. 8 Α. Were you interested in hearing Gary Graham's version of 9 events prior to his demotion? 10 11 Α. No, ma'am. 12 Why not? 0 13 I made up my mind. Α. Based upon what? 14 15 The report and the interviews with the various POs that 16 I talked to. Did you have any information regarding what Gary 17 18 Graham's position on everything was? 19 Α. I may have had some in some fashion, I don't know. But 20 I didn't ask him anything.
- 24 Well, ma'am, I know there was a lawsuit going, and I had 25 made up my mind, partially on the sexual allegations but

altered your decision to demote him?

Did it occur to you at that time that he may have had

something to say that would have changed your mind or

- 1 even more so on the office leadership. So that was
- 2 history.
- 3 Q And your decision that Gary -- strike that -- your loss
- 4 of confidence in Gary's ability to manage, I believe
- 5 those were your words, was based upon the contents of
- 6 the Deluce report?
- 7 A. And my interviews with other people, other POs.
- 8 MS. BLANCHARD: That's all I have.
- 9 MS. WILLIAMS: Anybody else?
- 10 MS. WALLET: I have one question.
- 11 BY MS. WALLET:
- 12 Q Judge, can you hear me from here?
- 13 A. Keep your voice up, ma'am.
- 14 Q I will. Since you took office in the first Monday in
- 15 January of 1998, have you promoted or approved the
- 16 promotion of any probation officers?
- 17 A. Oh, I suppose I have. I had to get a replacement for
- 18 Mr. Graham. I've also fired one person.
- 19 Q Okay. Did you promote Sam Miller?
- 20 A. I think I did.
- 21 Q Did you promote Denny Drachbar?
- 22 A. I think so, I'm not sure.
- 23 Q Did you promote Debra Green?
- 24 A. I don't remember anymore, ma'am. I'd have to look at
- 25 the records.

Are you aware of anyone who you promoted or you approved for promotion who is not the most senior individual? A. I don't remember, ma'am. MS. WALLET: That's all. MS. WILLIAMS: Thank you very much, Judge. MS. BLANCHARD: Thank you. (Whereupon, the deposition was concluded at 4:14 p.m.) 

COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA )

SS.

COUNTY OF DAUPHIN )

I, Emily R. Clark, Reporter and Notary Public in and for the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania and County of Dauphin, do hereby certify that the foregoing testimony was taken before me at the time and place hereinbefore set forth, and that it is the testimony of:

HON. GEORGE E. HOFFER

I further certify that said witness was by me duly sworn to testify the whole and complete truth in said cause; that the testimony then given was reported by me stenographically, and subsequently transcribed under my direction and supervision; and that the foregoing is a full, true and correct transcript of my original shorthand notes.

I further certify that I am not counsel for nor related to any of the parties to the foregoing cause, nor employed by them or their attorneys, and am not interested in the subject matter or outcome thereof.

Dated at Harrisburg, Pennsylvania, this 23rd day of April, 2003.

Emily R. Clark

Emily R. Clark
Reporter - Notary Public

(The foregoing certification does not apply to any reproduction of the same by any means unless under the direct control and/or supervision of the certifying reporter.)